

# REPORT OF THE JUDICIAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE CLASHES BETWEEN THE ISLAMIC MOVEMENT IN NIGERIA (IMN) AND THE NIGERIAN ARMY (NA) IN ZARIA, KADUNA STATE BETWEEN SATURDAY 12<sup>TH</sup> AND MONDAY 14<sup>TH</sup> DECEMBER 2015.

## JULY, 2016

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page i of xxiv

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>T</b> :(1 <b>D</b>						Page
1.	Title Page					•••	
2.	Table of Contents				•••		ii - x
3.	Executive Summary			•••	•••		xi - xxiv
4.	CHAPTER ONE- INT	RODUCTI	ON				1
	1.1 Background						1
	1.2 Appointment ar	nd Mandate	e				3
	1.3 Modus Operan	di					6
	1.4 Public Sitting a	nd Hea <mark>r</mark> ing	of Pre	sentat	ion		10
	1.5 Memoranda an	d Exhibits I	pefore <sup>-</sup>	the Co	ommis	sion	19
	1.6 Visit to Locus ir	ו Quo		• • • •			20
	1.7 Conclusion of F	Public Hea <mark>r</mark>	ing				20
	1.8 Submission of l	Reports					21
	1.9 Methodology of	<sup>r</sup> Work		•••			21
5.	CHAPTER TWO:						22
2.1	FACTORS AND ACT Background 2.2 Findings/Obser 2.2.1 Immediate Cau	vations				22 	ON 28 28
	2.3 Recommendati	ons		•••	•••	•••	31
6.	CHAPTER THREE:	••• •••	•••	•••			32
	TOR (B) TO CIRCUMSTANCES, RIBUTORY FACTOR CLASHES	SURROL	JNDIN	G	AND		NT-
	3.1 Background						32
	3.2 Fir.dings/Obser	vations	•••				46
	3.2.1 Historical Circu					•••	46
	3.2.2 Remote Causes	S		•••			49
	3.2.3 Other Contribut						52
	3.3 Recommendati	-					54

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page ii of xxiv

7.	CHA	PTER	FOUF	र:	•••			•••			56
		ED,	O AS WOUI								NS HE
	4.2 4.4.1 4.4.2 4.4.3 4.4.4	Findi Deac The \ Missi Othe	ground ngs/Ot Persc Vound ng Per rs mmen	oserva ons ed sons 	ations  	  	 	···· ···· ····		 	56 57 57 58 59 59 60
8.			FIVE								61
TOR	BÉEN CLAS PROF	N DA SHES, PERT	ENTIF AMAGE THE Y ANE MAGE	) de NWO THE	OR NERS E VAL	DEST 6 OR .UES	ROYI OCC CLAIN	ED ( UPIE	DURIN RS C	NG 1 DF SL	THE ICH
			ground ngs on						 naged,		61
	5.2.1	Their Obse	Öwne rvatior mmen	rs and ns	d Clai 	ms 	•••	· · · ·			62 66 67
9.	CHAF	PTER	SIX	•••	•••	••••	• -	•••	•••	•••	68
	OMM AND NMEI EMEI	ISSIC RE NTAL RGEN	fo ID DN OF Eligic , fee Icy ND Af	REL SUS DERA RES	EVAN INS L A PON	NT PI TITU ND SE	ERSO TIONS STAT AGE	NS, <sup>-</sup> S, E A(	TRAD NON- CTOR	ITION GOVE	AL ER- ND
	6.1.1 6.1.2 6.1.3 6.1.4 6.1.5	The F Kadu The N The N SSS	grounc edera na Sta ligeria ligeria and the ic Mov	l Gove te Go n Arm Polic e Inte	ernme vernr ny (N/ e For Iligen	ent nent A) ce ce Co	 mmur	   nity	···· ···· ····	···· ···· ···· ····	68 69 70 71 72 72

- .

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page iii of xxiv

"TOP	SECRET"
------	---------

۰.

	<ul> <li>6.2 Findings/Obser</li> <li>6.2.1 Federal Govern</li> <li>6.2.2 Kaduna State C</li> <li>6.2.3 Nigerian Army C</li> <li>6.2.4 Nigeria Police F</li> <li>6.2.5 SSS and Intellig</li> <li>6.2.6 Islamic Movem</li> <li>6.3 Recommendation</li> </ul>	nment Governm (NA) Force gence Co ent in Nig	 ent  ommu	  inity (IMN)	••••	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	···· ···· ···· ····	73 73 75 76 77 79 79 82
10.	CHAPTER SEVEN:	••• •		• • •	•••		•••	83
	CIRCUMSTANCES I 7.1 Background 7.2 Findings/Obser 7.2.1 Nigerian Army 7.2.2 Islamic Moveme 7.2.3 Kaduna State G 7.2.4 Federal Govern 7.2.5 Nigeria Police F	OMISS ABOVE AND NWHICE vations .  ent in Nig Sovernme ment .	SION E W SUF H THE	IDEI /ERE FICIE EY O( 	NTIFII NT CCUR  	ED II NECE IN RED  	N SL SSAF	IB-
	7.2.6 Other Security FRSC, Immigra	-				• • •	•••	104
11.	CHAPTER EIGHT		•••		•••	•••	•••	106
	TOR (G) TO DETE ISLAMIC MOVEMEN ORGANIZATION, ST ASSETS, RESOURC AND HOW ANY OF ANY ENGAGMEN CONSTITUTED AU AGENCIES	NT IN NI TRUCTU ES, ( ALL O NT W	IGERI RE, M CULT F THI /ITH	IA, IT IEMB URE ESE TH	s leo Ersf And Cont E	Gal ( 11P G Pra Pra Ribu Comi	STATI ROW CTICI ITED MUNI	JS, TH, ES, TO TY,
	<ul> <li>8.1 Background</li> <li>8.2 Findings/Obser</li> <li>8.2.1 Recommendation</li> <li>8.3 Findings/Obser</li> <li>8.3.1 Recommendation</li> </ul>	vations c ons . vations c		Origi  N Lea	ns of 	IMN  ip	···· ···· ····	106 107 110 111 117
	"Τ	OP SEC	CRET	Γ"			JUD	COM F

JUDCOM Page iv of xxiv

٠

•

8.4 Legal Status of the Islamic Movement in			
Nigeria			118
8.4.1 Determination of Legal Status		•••	118
8.4.2 Legal Status of the Islamic Movement in			
Nigeria (IMN)			121
8.4.3 Recommendations			122
8.5 Nature, Organization and Structure of the	ne		
Islamic Movement in Nigeria (IMN)			123
8.5.1 Findings/Observations			123
8.5.2 Recommendations on Nature of the IMI			126
8.6 Organization and Structure of the IMN			127
8.6.1 Findings/Observations			127
8.6.2 Organogram of the Leadership of the IM			132
8.6.3 Recommendations on Organization and		•••	152
Structure Structure			133
8.7 Membership and Growth of IMN		•••	
		•••	133
•	•••	•••	133
8.7.2 Recommendations on Membership Gro		•••	139
8.8 Resources and Assets		•••	139
8.8.1 Membership			139
8.8.2 International Resources and Assets	•••	•••	140
8.8:3 Recommendations on International			
Resources and Assets			140
8.8.4 Culture and Practices			140
8.8.5 Recommendations on Culture and Prac	tices		141
8.9 Engagement with Communities, Constit	uted		
Authorities and Security Agencies			142
8.9.1 Communities			142
8.9.2 Authorities			142
CHAPTER NINE			144
TOR (H) TO REVIEW ALL FACTORS	ISS	UES	OR
MATTERS, INCLUDING ALLEGED INVO			
FOREIGN OR DOMESTIC ACTORS			
INFLUENCE OR INSTIGATION THAT			
CONTRIBUTED TO THE INCIDENT OR M			
TO SUCH INCIDENCE IN THE FUTUR			
RECOMMENDATIONS THERETO			
•			
9.1 Background	•••	•••	144
9.2 Findings/Observations	•••	•••	147

**"TOP SECRET"** 

12.

.

JUDCOM Page **v** of **xxiv** 

	9.2.1 Domestic Actors	147
	9.2.2 International Actors	148
	9.2.2.1 Iran	148
	9.2.2.2 Lebanon	149
	9.2.2.3 Ghana/Niger	149
	9.3 Observation	149
	9.4 Recommendations	15 <b>0</b>
13.	CHAPTER TEN	151
	TOR (I): TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS TO	гнг
	KADUNA STATE GOVERNMENT AND THE FEDER	
	GOVERNMENT AS TO DIRECT OR INDIRE	
	RESPONSIBILITY FOR ANY ACTS OF COMMISSION	
	OMISSION IDENTIFIED IN SUB-PARAGRAPH (E) ABOV	
	10.1 Background	151
	10.2 Recommendation	152
	10.3 The Kaduna State Government	152
	10.4 The Federal Government	154
4 4		158
14.	CHAPTER ELEVEN	100
	TOR (j) "TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS AS	то
		AT
	ADMINISTRATIVE OR CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY	
	FURTHER DETERMINED BY THE APPROPRIA	
	ADMINISTRATIVE OR JUDICIAL AUTHORITIES FOR A	
	IDENTIFIED ACTS OR OMISSIONS"	INI
		158
	11.2 Recommendations	158

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page vi of xxiv

15.	CHAPTER TWELVE 162	
	TOR (k) TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS AS TO ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN, POLICIES TO BE DEVELOPED AND IMPLEMENTED TO · ENSURE THAT ACTS AND OMISSIONSTHAT MAY HAVE CONTRIBUTED OR LED TO THE CLASHES ARE PRE-EMPTED ENTIRELY OR, WHERE THEY OCCUR, THEIR NEGATIVE EFFECTS ARE MITIGATED IN FUTURE	
	12.1 Background          162         12.2 Findings/Observations         164         12.3 Recommendations         165         12.3.1 Islamic Movement in Nigeria         165         12.3.2 Nigerian Army         166         12.3.3 Kaduna State Government         167         12.3.4 Federal Government of Nigeria         168	
16.	CHAPTER THIRTEEN 170	
	TOR (I) TO RECOMMEND ANY MATTER FOR PROSECUTION, FURTHER INVESTIGATION OR THE CONVENING OF A SEPARATE INQUIRY TO THE APPROPRIATE LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY, GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENT OR PROSECUTOR REGARDING THE CONDUCT OF A CERTAIN PERSON OR	
	PERSONS         13.1 Background         170         13.2 Findings/Observations         171	
	13.2.1 Islamic Movement in Nigeria (IMN)        171         13.2.2 Recommendations         172	
	13.3 Nigeria Army (NA) 173	
	13.3.1 Recommendations 173	
	13.4 Nigeria Police, SSS and Other Law	
	Enforcement/Security Agencies 174	
	13.4.1 Recommendations 175	
	13.5 Federal Government/Kaduna State	
	Government – Federal and State Ministries	
	of Justice 175	
	13.5.1 Recommendations 176	

JUDCOM Page vii of xxiv

17.	CHAPTER FOURTEEN	•••	•••	177
	TOR (m) TO INVESTIGATE ANY OTH INCIDENTAL OR RELEVANT TERMSOFINQUIRY WHICH, IN THE O VIEW, SHOULD BE INVESTIGATED AN OTHER PERTINENT RECOMMENDATIO DEEMS NECESSARY FOR THE PURPOSE	TO COMN D M/	THE 1ISSIO	ESE N'S
	14.1 Background			177
	14.2 Findings/Observations			177
	14.3 Recommendations			178
18	CHAPTER FIFTEEN	•••	•••	180
	GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS, OBSERV	ΆΤΙΟ	NS	
	15.1 Background	••••		180
	GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS			180
	15.2 Employment			180
	15.3 Responsibility of Parents to the Children	۱		181
	5 1	•••		181
	15.5 Implementation of Reports of Commissi	ons		
	Of Inquiry			182
	15.6 The Role of Traditional Institutions		•••	182
	15.7 Proliferation of Small Arms and Light			
	Weapons	•••	•••	183
	15.8 General Observations and Conclusions			183
	15.9 The State of the Nation	•••	•••	183
	15.10 On the Challenge of Security	•••		188

## 19. List of Appendixes

Appendix 1-	Instrument Establishing the Judicial	
	Commission of Inquiry (JCI)	 194
Appendix 2-	Rules of Procedure for the Judicial	
	Commission of Inquiry (JCI)	 198

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page viii of xxiv

Appendix 3-	List of Adverts - Print and	
	Electronic Media	206
Appendix 4-	List of Invitations/Summons issued	
	by the Commission	210
Appendix 5-	Letter from the Counsel of the Islamic	
	Movement in Nigeria (IMN) – akika,	
	abashi, okoye & mann	259
Appendix 6-	Amnesty International Report:	
	NIGERIA-'UNEARTHING THE TRUTH':	
	Unlawful Killings and Mass Cover-Up	
	in Zaria	268
Appendix 7-	List of Memoranda submitted to the JCI:	269
a)	memoranda submitted via email	
	of the Commission	
b)	memoranda submitted at the	
	Secretariat of the Commission	
c)	memoranda that were heard at the	
	Public Proceedings of the commission	
Appendix 8-	List of Exhibits- Documentary,	
	Electronic and Real	270
Appendix 9-	List of Witnesses that testified before	
	the Commission	276
Appendix 10-	List of Audio and Video cassettes,	
	Ds/Flash Submitted to the Commission	282

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page ix of xxiv

Appendix 11-	Photo Album showing pictures taken	
	during the Commission's inauguration,	
	public proceedings and visit to locus	
	in quo (Inspection of sites of the	
	clashes in Zaria and mass grave	
	site at Mando Kaduna)	284
Appendix 12-	List of Audio and Video Records of Public	
	Proceedings of the Commission	285
Appendix 13-	Records of proceedings of the Commission	287
Appendix 14-	List of Counsel that appeared before	
	the Commission	288
Appendix 15-	List of Consultants engaged by the	
	Commission:	291
a)	Research Consultants	
b)	Report Writing Experts	
c)	Media consultant	
Appendix 16-	List of Commissioned Research Papers by	
	the Research Consultants-Bound copy	<b>29</b> 2
Appendix 17-	List of Co-opted staff who served at the	
	Secretariat of the Commission	293

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page **x** of **xxiv** 

ļ

#### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In December 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> 2015, hundreds of people were killed in Zaria following clashes between the Nigerian Army (NA) and the Islamic Movement in Nigeria (IMN). The location known as PZ junction is in the city centre on the strategic public highway, which links Zaria with surrounding cities. The IMN, a religious movement with a large following all over Northern Nigeria and other parts of the country was conducting a "hoisting" of flag ceremony" at their national headquarters in Zaria called Hussainiyya Baqiyyatillah. A large crowd of IMN members were controlling the traffic on that very busy highway and had set up a road block just as the convoy of the Chief of Army Staff (COAS), was coming from Dutse, Jigawa State to attend the Passing out Parade (PoP) ceremony of the 73<sup>rd</sup> regular recruits at the NA Depot, Zaria. The officers on the COAS entourage made attempts to persuade the IMN members to lift the barricade to enable the convoy pass to no avail. This led to the forceful clearance of the roadblock by men of the NA through the use of lethal force. With the blockade cleared, the COAS proceeded to the Emir's palace in Zaria city and subsequently to the NA Depot in Sabon Gari for the ceremony. The interpretation of the NA was that the roadblock constituted an assassination attempt on the life of their COAS and the intelligence available to them was that the IMN was regrouping and had also called their members from surrounding towns to join those already in Zaria to cause mayhem in Zaria. The intelligence available to the NA also indicated that the IMN had amassed arms and therefore had the capacity to precipitate a breakdown of law and order. The NA therefore decided to conduct a Cordon and Search (C&S) operations to recover the suspected arms cache, maintain

"TOP SECRET"

JUDCOM Page xi of xxiv

law and order and arrest the IMN leader, Ibraheem El-Zakzaky. The C&S operations were carried out at three locations – the *Hussainiyya Baqiyattillah* headquarters at PZ junction, the *Gyallesu* residence of the IMN leader and the *Darul Rahma* centre of the IMN at Dambo. In the wake of these operations, there was the breach of peace, law and order, hundreds of lives were lost and a significant number of moveable and immoveable properties worth millions of Naira were destroyed and or damaged. On the night of 14/15 December 2015, the Kaduna State Government carried out the burial of an estimated 347 dead persons in a mass grave at a Cemetery off Mando road, Kaduna.

Following these clashes between the NA and the IMN, the resulting consequences, and the need to forestall future occurrence, the Governor of Kaduna State, Malam Nasir Ahmad El-Rufai, pursuant to the powers vested on him by the provisions of Section 2 (1) of the Commission of Inquiry Law, Cap 34, Laws of Kaduna State, 1991, issued an order, creating the 13-member Judicial Commission of Inquiry under the Chairmanship of Hon. Justice Muhammed Lawal Garba, JCA with a defined Terms of Reference (TOR).

The Commission, which was inaugurated on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2016, was given the responsibility to determine the immediate causes of the clashes; to determine the historical circumstances, surrounding and contributory factors and emote causes of the clashes; to ascertain the number of persons killed, wounded or missing during the clashes and to identify all property alleged to have been damaged or destroyed during the clashes, the owners or occupiers of such property and the values claimed by them

#### "TOP SECRET"

JUDCOM Page xii of xxiv

for such damage or destruction. The Commission was also asked to identify acts of commission and omission of relevant persons, traditional and religious institutions, non-governmental, Federal and State actors and emergency response agencies before, during and after the clashes and to determine whether the acts of commission and omission so identified were necessary, appropriate and sufficient in the circumstances in which they occurred. The Commission was also to determine the evolution of the Islamic Movement in Nigeria and how the organisation contributed to any engagement with the community, constituted authorities and the security agencies while reviewing all other factors that may have contributed to the incident or may conduce to such incidences in the future and make recommendations thereto.

One of the direct parties, the IMN neither sent memoranda nor appeared. Their counsel wrote the Commission stating they had no access to their client and IMN leader, Ibraheem El-Zakzaky and therefore could not receive instructions to present their memoranda. The Commission received a total of **3,578 (Hard Copies 132 and Emails 3,446)** memoranda. A total number of **102** memoranda were heard by the Commission during its proceedings. It admitted a total of **39 exhibits** and a total number of **87** witnesses testified before the Commission.

In conducting its assignment, the Commission called for the submission of and received memoranda from individuals and groups both in public and private sectors. The Commission also held public sitting from 22<sup>nd</sup> February, 2016 to 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016, whereof it took testimonies of witnesses, admitted exhibits and visited and inspected the sites affected by the December 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup>, 2015 clashes in Zaria and its environs. During its

"TOP SECRET" . JUDCOM Page xiii of xxiv

Visit to Locus in Quo (i.e inspection of the sites of the clashes), the Commission and other stakeholders were conducted round the following sites: Jushi, Banzazzau, Dambo, Gyallesu, Hussainiya Headquarters of IMN and the Police Motor Traffic Division (MTD) all in Zaria and therefrom proceeded to the Mando Mass Grave site in Kaduna. It finally visited Emir of Zazzau at his Kaduna residence.

Among others, the key immediate causes were: the act of the road blockade mounted by the IMN on a very busy highway leading to PZ junction en route to the NA Depot at what is popularly referred to as *Hussainiyya Baqiyyatilah* for the "hoisting of the flag ceremony" at the venue, which resulted in the ensuing verbal altercations including traffic congestion/confusions, the "alleged" assassination attempt on Chief of Army Staff (COAS), the forceful clearance of the blockade and shootings.

Right from inception the IMN has the practice of radicalising its members which resulted in frequent clashes with constituted authorities in Zaria, its environs and many states across the Nation. This led to disruption and threat to peace, law and order.

The IMN has been steadfast and deliberate in widespread and habitual acts of lawlessness and defiance of constituted authorities including refusal to recognise the legitimacy, authority and the Constitution of the Nigerian State. Therefore clashes continued with the IMN on the one hand and the Nigerian constituted authorities and immediate (Sunni Muslim) community on the other, mainly due to weak and poor decisive/proactive actions and measures by appropriate constituted authorities.

#### **"TOP SECRET"**

JUDCOM Page xiv of xxiv

On the number of persons killed, wounded or missing during the clashes, the Commission found that in all, a total number of 349 persons including one (1) military personnel (a soldier) lost their lives. Also, out of the said 349 dead persons, 347 (excluding the Soldier) were buried in a mass grave at Mando burial ground by the Kaduna State Government. Also, a total number of 66 IMN members (53 males and 13 females) and one (1) senior military Officer were injured. However, there was no evidence before the Commission to confirm if there were any missing persons from the clashes. The Commission received evidence from persons who said they had lost their property due to the clash between the NA and the IMN from the 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> December 2015. As the IMN refused to appear before the Commission although they were given every opportunity to do so, the Commission could not determine the number of property belonging to them that might have been damaged or destroyed. The Commission's overview of properties identified as destroyed or damaged which include: the structures at the Hussainiyya Baqiyyatillah Headquarters of the IMN; the private residence of El-Zakzaky at Gyallesu; the tomb of the mother of El-Zakzaky, also known as Gidan Hari Jamo, at Unguwar Jushi; Foudiyya Centre at Dan-Magaji, IMN's educational Centre; IMN's cemetery at Dambo Village; the Commission inspected 2 no. Toyota SUV's, 30 motor cycles and 65 No. vehicles at Motor Traffic Division (MTD), Zaria which were recovered from the Hussainiyya Bagiyyatillah site. Furthermore, several properties include, but not limited to, buildings, cars and motorcycles belonging to non-IMN persons affected by the clashes. The Gyallesu Community being the primary location of the cordon and search operation of the NA and also the location of most of the destruction submitted in its memo a comprehensive table of damages.

"TOP SECRET"

JUDCOM Page xv of xxiv

Consequently, the Commission found that numerous properties owned by different groups and individuals were damaged and destroyed some of which include; motor vehicles, motor cycles, buildings etc, all of which belong to IMN and other identified persons/individuals. These properties are worth millions of Naira.

There was lack of political will at all levels of government to take proactive, appropriate and guick steps/measures including provision of proper and adequate equipment and training of law enforcement agencies especially the Police Force against seemingly dangerous Nigerian groups/organizations. Also government lack the political will to implement many of the recommendations of reports of previous Commissions of Inquiry relating to the IMN and other groups in order to tackle these incessant clashes and threats to peace, law and order in the nation. Added to this, it is on record that that the IMN including its leadership don't have regards for constituted authorities, thereby adopted the habit of mounting illegal road blocks, check points and unjustifiably restricting movement of innocent citizens including the Chief of Army Staff. However, having regard to the strength of the IMN members or crowd, they confronted at Hussainiyya Bagiyyatillah, and the assorted weapons wielded and/or recovered, there appeared to be a disproportionate use of force by the NA to deal with the situation, hence the Nigerian Army used excessive force in dealing with the 12<sup>th</sup>to 14<sup>th</sup> December 2015 clashes in Zaria.

The Commission found *e* mong others that IMN started in a form of students' activism within the Muslim Students Society (MSS) in Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria in the late 1970s.Subsequently the organisation transformed into an ideologically focused mass religious movement. Sheikh

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page xvi of xxiv

Ibraheem El-Zakzaky is the overall Temporal and Spiritual leader of the Movement. All members obey his command and hold him in high esteem. Though there are no reliable statistics as to the exact number of membership, the Commission was informed that IMN has an estimated membership of about 60,000 people. The IMN did not register as a corporate body or legal entity under the Nigerian law.

As is the case with most religious movements, the greatest resource and asset of the IMN is its members. They devote their time, assets, money and networks to the well-being and development of the Movement. Apart from member contributions, it is also widely speculated that the IMN has access to some international resources and assets. Some of the unconfirmed but strongly believed International contributors are: Iranian religious establishments and some Lebanese businesses and networks in Nigeria.

The clash of 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> December 2015 was an incident of monumental gravity involving very weighty human right matters and the all-important and critical issue of national security, peace and stability. These are matters that must not be brushed aside, nor yet handled with levity for two fundamental reasons namely, (i) the enormity of the wages and consequences of flagrant failure to secure or protect the fundamental rights of every Nigerian citizen, and (ii) the unsavoury and unacceptable nature of any form of defiance or rebellion to constituted authority in a manner that threatens national security.

Those individuals, groups, organizations or institutions that acted or refused to act in ways that led to trampling upon the rights of others must be brought to justice. Similarly those individuals whose actions and

"TOP SECRET" JUDCOM Page xvii of xxiv

tendencies are not only defiant, but also threatening the security of the country must be dealt with squarely according to the laws of the land.

It is instructive to further emphasize here that the direct parties involved in this incident are the NA and the IMN. While this does not in any way dismiss the importance of other parties and stakeholders in bearing responsibility for any act of omission or commission directly or indirectly, the centrality of the roles played by these two parties ordains the fact that the two must certainly bear larger portion of that. In this regard, the Commission gives greater attention to these two parties while it also identified other important stakeholders that must be held responsible for certain acts of omission or commission that led to or rather aggravate the unfortunate incident of the 12<sup>th</sup> -14<sup>th</sup> December, 2015.

In conclusion, the Commission found that the Federal Government, Kaduna State Government, the IMN, the Nigerian Army and other Security and law enforcement agencies committed certain acts of commission or omission which resulted in the avoidable 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> December,2015 Zaria clashes. Consequently and in the light of the above findings amongst others, the Commission has made a number of recommendations to the Kaduna State Government and the Federal Government to address all specific areas that led to these regrettable clashes, loss of lives and properties.

#### THE KADUNA STATE GOVERNMENT

 i) Considering the nature and organizational structure of the IMN, where the leader has the total control over the members, Sheikh Ibraheem EI-Zakzaky should be personally held

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page xviii of xxiv

responsible for all the acts of commission and omission of the entire membership of the Islamic Movement in Nigeria in its clashes with the Nigerian Army for refusing to call his members to order when required to do so.

- ii) All incidents of violence and aggression by the members of the IMN against individuals, groups or communities, which have resulted in grievous bodily harm, destruction of properties and deaths, should be fully investigated and culprits brought to book. Where appropriate, compensations should be paid.
- iii) The State Government should investigate and repossess all illegally acquired public lands from IMN and utilize same for Public Interest.
- iv) IMN should be made to conform to all constitutional requirements and the provisions of other by-laws in obtaining land, building or acquiring structures. It must conform to all building regulations, however, whenever and wherever it so desires to build or acquire land or property.
- v) All the dangerous weapons recovered from the IMN members should be turned over to the Police for further necessary action.
- vi) The Government should deal with the IMN in accordance with the laws and regulations of the land and be made to conduct its activities and affairs within the ambit of the law at all times.
- vii) Intelligence reports by security agencies regarding threats to security, law and order should be taken seriously and acted upon timeously to nip in the bud such occurrence.

"TOP SECRET" JUDCOM Page xix of xxiv

- viii) Mechanism should be put in place for the proposed Bill on Religious Preaching to be passed into law as quickly as possible and implemented with a view to purging Religious Groups which embark on provocative teachings and preaching.
- ix) Compensation should be paid to all those persons who complained before the Commission that their properties were either destroyed or damaged as a result of the clash.
- x) The Government should make effort to reduce the number of idle hands that might otherwise be willing recruits for the Movement by providing employment to the teaming masses of the State.
- xi) The prospects of constructive engagement with the leadership of the IMN should not be foreclosed.
- xii) The State Government should ensure that investigations against all persons under detention in respect of these clashes between the NA and the IMN on 12<sup>th</sup> – 14<sup>th</sup> December, 2015 are concluded and treated expeditiously.

#### THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

i) The Commission is of the view that the use of excessive force by the Nigerian Army, which led to the heavy casualties recorded in the Cordon and Search Operation is an act of commission for which the NA is directly responsible. The Commission therefore recommends that steps should immediately be taken to identify the members of the NA who participated in the killings of 12<sup>th</sup> – 14<sup>th</sup> December 2015 incident with a view to prosecuting them.

"TOP SECRET"

JUDCOM Page xx of xxiv

- ii) The Federal Government should ensure that investigations against all persons under detention in respect of this clashes between the NA and the IMN on 12<sup>th</sup> 14<sup>th</sup> December, 2015 are concluded and treated expeditiously.
- iii) All incidents of violence and aggression by the members of the IMN against individuals, groups or communities, which have resulted in grievous bodily harm, destruction of properties and deaths, should be fully investigated and culprits brought to book. Where appropriate, compensations should be paid.
- iv) Considering the nature and organizational structure of the IMN, where the leader has the total control over the members, Sheikh Ibraheem EI-Zakzaky should be personally held responsible for all the acts of commission and omission of the entire membership of the Islamic Movement in Nigeria in its clashes with the Nigerian Army for refusing to call his members to order when required to do so.
- v) The Federal Government should explore diplomatic means to dissuade other Countries from interfering in the Internal Affairs of Nigeria.
- vi) The prospects of constructive engagement with the leadership of the IMN should not be foreclosed.
- vii) The Government should deal with the IMN in accordance with the laws and regulations of the land and be made to conduct its activities and affairs within the ambit of the law at all times.

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page xxi of xxiv

- viii) Members of the IMN should never be allowed to carry any unlicensed weapon under any guise. Whosoever found so doing should be prosecuted immediately.
- ix) All the dangerous weapons recovered from the IMN members should be turned over to the Police for further necessary action.
- Intelligence reports by security agencies regarding all threats to security, law and order should be taken seriously and acted upon timeously to nip in the bud such occurrences.
- xi) The Federal Government should have the political will to deal with such threats posed by the IMN and similar groups. Testimonies at the proceedings of the Commission by various stakeholders. pointed to non-implementation of the recommendations of previous reports of other Commissions of Inquiry relating to the IMN and other groups who were found to have posed grave threats to law, order and peaceful coexistence. Of particular relevance were the Galtimari and the Sheikh Lemu Presidential Commission pertaining to Boko Haram insurgency.
- xii) The Federal Government should be proactive in its dealing with threats posed by groups such as the IMN.
- xiii) The Federal Government Agencies should respond positively to requests for information by Commissions of Inquiry such as this Commission to enable it make informed decisions or come to a firm findings on issues based on credible data held by them that is not in the public domain.

"TOP SECRET"

JUDCOM Page xxii of xxiv

- xiv) The Federal Government should ensure the presence of the Nigeria Police and other Security Agencies in every community and other flash point areas for effective maintenance of law and order.
- xv) Efforts should be made by the Police Authorities to revisit the system of Nigeria Mobile Police Force Unit, as it was in the yesteryears, so that involvement of the Military in the management of civil disorder would be minimized.
- xvi) The Police Authority should ensure that recruitment into the Force should be done on merit, suitability and good character as the Nigeria Police of today contains all manner of characters.
- xvii) The Federal Government should ensure professionalizing the Nigeria Police and other Security Agencies through capacity building, procurement of civil disorder management equipment and improved welfare.
- xviii) The Security Agencies should ensure 'watch listing' of IMN members and other persons of security interests, whenever they are going out of or coming back into Nigeria with a view to discovering the sources of their funding, foreign contacts and other relevant and useful information.
- xix) The Federal Government should not ignore the touted boast by the IMN that it has its members all across the security services who feed it with counter intelligence.

**"TOP SECRET"** 

JUDCOM Page xxiii of xxiv

ζ.

- xx) The Security agencies aside having an effective synergy should further strengthen their intelligence gathering mechanism in respect of the activities of the group so as to ensure prompt and timely interventions.
- xxi) The Federal Government should facilitate the establishment of Community Policing in its real sense in Nigeria with a view to curbing immediately any breach of law and order in any Community.
- xxii) The Federal Government should ensure that it develops and implement properly intelligence driven operation policies for the country.
- xxiii) The Federal Government should review the adequacy of the existing rules of engagement pertaining to internal security operations and bring them into conformity with constitutional stipulations and in accord with democratic norms and humanitarian best practices.

The Commission made some general recommendations that affect both Federal and State Governments relating to employment, responsibility of parents to their children, enhancing citizenship, the role of traditional institutions and proliferation of small arms and light weapons in the country.

#### **"TOP SECRET"**

JUDCOM Page xxiv of xxiv